FILE COPY

SEP 12 1973

MICHAEL RODAK, JR., CLERK

IN THE

Supreme Court of the United States

October Term, 1973

No. 73-5082

UNITED STATES OF AMERICA, ex. rel.
MANUEL A. GONZALEZ,

Petitioner,

—against—

JOHN ZELKER, as Warden of Green Haven Prison at Stormville, New York,

Respondent.

BRIEF IN OPPOSITION TO PETITION FOR A WRIT OF CERTIORARI TO THE UNITED STATES COURT OF APPEALS FOR THE SECOND CIRCUIT

WILLIAM CAHN
District Attorney, Nassau County
Attorney for Respondent
County Court House
Mineola, New York 11501

HENRY P. DEVINE
JULES E. ORENSTEIN
Assistant District Attorneys
of Counsel.

PETITION NOT PRINTED

TABLE OF CONTENTS OF BRIEF

	PAGE
Opinions Below	2
Jurisdiction	3
Constitutional Provisions Involved	
Amendment V	3
Amendment XIV	3
Prior Proceedings	
New York State Proceedings	4
Federal Proceedings	4
Background and Statement of Facts	5
The State Trial	6
The Federal District Court Hearing	13
Summary and Totality of All the Facts and Circumstances	14
Reasons for Denying the Writ	
I. No real conflict in the Circuits and in the New York State Court of Appeals	16
II. Any apparent conflict resolved by this Court's action in *Neil* v. *Biggers*, 409 U.S. 188	19
III. The instant case is not the proper case to decide the apparent conflict	20
IV. Using the totality of the circumstances test, petitioner was not denied due process of law by the in-court identification by Mrs. D'Amora of Gonzalez	21

PAGE

V. No danger of irreparable harm or mistaken identification in the instant case 32

VI. Conclusory observations 32

Conclusion 37

Appendix A—Opinion of the United States Court of Appeals below 1a

Appendix B—Report of Magistrate Goettel dated September 24, 1971 ..... 18a

Appendix C—Magistrate Gottel's report and recommendation dated May 17, 1972. 30a

Appendix D—Order of United States District Court Judge Irving Ben Cooper dated June 19, 1972, confirming the Magistrate's report 44a

Appendix E—Deposition of Mrs. Marguerite D'Amora 46a

TABLE OF CASES CITED

Ash v. United States, 41 U.S.L.W. 3390 20

Carter v. Mancusi, 460 F. 2d 406 [2d Cir. 1972] .. 18

Desist v. United States, 394 U.S. 244 34

Foster v. California, 394 U.S. 440 ..... 23, 25

Gonzalez v. Zelker, 477 F. 2d 797 [1973] 18, 20

Jenkins v. Delaware, 395 U.S. 214 34

Johnson v. New Jersey, 384 U.S. 719 ..... 16, 33

Kaiser v. New York, 394 U.S. 280 34

PAGE

Kirby v. Illinois, 406 U.S. 682 36

Massiah v. United States, 377 U.S. 201 36

Miranda v. Arizona, 384 U.S. 436 16

Neil v. Biggers, 409 U.S. 188 [1972] 16, 17, 19, 20, 27, 30, 31

People v. Bellott, 20 N.Y. 2d 600 19

People v. Beyer, 25 N.Y. 2d 833 19

People v. Brown, 20 N.Y. 2d 238 18

People v. Burwell, 26 N.Y. 2d 331, 336 19

People v. Caruso, 68 Cal. 2d 183, 188
65 Cal. Rptr. 336, 340, 436 P. 2d 336, 340 [1968] 24

People v. Feinlowitz, 29 N.Y. 2d 176 34

People v. Ganci, 27 N.Y. 2d 418, 429 19

People v. Logan, 25 N.Y. 2d 184 19

Simmons v. United States, 390 U.S. 377 [1968] 3, 16, 17, 18, 20, 21, 24

Snyder v. Massachusetts, 291 U.S. 97, 105 35

Stovall v. Denno, 388 U.S. 293 [1967] 16, 17, 20, 21, 28, 34

United States ex rel. Anderson v. Mancusi, 413 F. 2d 1012 ..... 24, 25

United States ex rel. Beyer v. Mancusi, 436 F. 2d 755 ..... 22, 24, 36

United States v. Gambrill, 499 F. 2d 1148 [D.C. Cir. 1971] 18, 20

PAGE

United States ex rel. Geralds v. Deegan 307 F. 2d 56 25

United States ex rel. Phipps v. Follette, 428 F. 2d 912 ..... 22, 24

United States ex rel. Rivera v. McKendrick, 448 F. 2d 30 23

United States ex rel. Rutherford v. Deegan, 406 F. 2d 217, cert. den. 385 U.S. 93 ..... 17, 24

United States ex rel. Springle v. Follette, 434 F. 2d 1380 ..... 22, 24

United States ex rel. Valentine v. Zelker, 322 F. 2d 440 24

United States ex rel. Vitiello v. Flood, 374 F. 2d 554 33

United States v. White, 401 U.S. 745 34

United States ex rel. Williams v. Lavallee, 415 F. 2d 643, cert. den. 397 U.S. 997 24

Williams v. United States, 401 U.S. 646 34

AUTHORITIES CITED

28 U.S.C. § 1254(1) 3

28 U.S.C. § 2241 1

28 U.S.C. § 2243 4

United States Constitution

Article III 36

Amendment V 1, 21

Amendment XIV 1, 21

Robertson and Kirkham, Jurisdiction of the Supreme Court of the United States 629 (Wolfson and Kurland ed. 1951) 19

Stern and Gressman, Supreme Court Practice 101 (1st Ed. 1950) 19

Gressman and Stern, Supreme Court Practice 157 (4th Ed. 1969) 20

Stern, Denial of Certiorari Despite a Conflict, 66 Harv. L. Rev. 465 (1953) 19

Mr. Justice Harlan, Some Aspects of the Judicial Process in the Supreme Court of the United States, 33 Australia L.J. 108 (1959) 20

IN THE

Supreme Court of the United States

October Term, 1973

No. 73-5082

UNITED STATES OF AMERICA, ex. rel.
MANUEL A. GONZALEZ,

Petitioner,

—against—

JOHN ZELKER, as Warden of Green Haven Prison at Stormville, New York,

Respondent.

BRIEF IN OPPOSITION TO PETITION FOR A WRIT OF CERTIORARI TO THE UNITED STATES COURT OF APPEALS FOR THE SECOND CIRCUIT

To the Honorable Chief Justice and Associate Justices of the Supreme Court of the United States:

The petitioner, Manuel A. Gonzalez, prays that a writ of certiorari issue to review a judgment and opinion of the United States Court of Appeals for the Second Circuit entered April 17, 1973, which reversed an order of the United States District Court for the Southern District of New York which had granted petitioner's application after a hearing for a post-conviction writ of habeas corpus pursuant to 28 U.S.C. § 2241, which writ of habeas corpus in effect set aside a New York State judgment of conviction for the crimes of Robbery, First Degree, Grand Larceny,